THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA BRYSON CITY DIVISION

CIVIL CASE NO. 2:11cv18

CATHERINE ANN CARPENTER,)
Plaintiff,	,)
vs.	ORDER
OLUFEMI ABIOLA BABALOLA, and MEDWEST HEALTH SYSTEM, INC., f/k/a HARRIS REGIONAL HOSPITAL, INC.,))))
Defendants.)))

THIS MATTER is before the Court on the following:

- (1) The Motion to Dismiss [Doc. 22] filed by the Defendant Olufemi Abiola Babalola; the Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction filed the Defendant Medwest Health System, Inc., f/k/a Harris Regional Hospital, Inc. ("Medwest") [Doc. 25];
- (2) The Motion to Dismiss for Improper Service [Doc. 31] filed by the Defendant Medwest; the Motion to Dismiss Defendant Medwest [Doc. 37] filed by the Plaintiff;

- (3) The Magistrate Judge's Memorandum and Recommendation [Doc. 48] regarding the disposition of these motions;
- (4) Defendant Babalola's Objections to the Magistrate Judge's Memorandum and Recommendation [Doc. 49];
- (5) Defendant Medwest's Response to Defendant Babalola's Objections to the Magistrate Judge's Memorandum and Recommendation [Doc. 50]; and
- (6) Plaintiff's Reply to Defendant Babalola's Objections to Magistrate

 Judge's Memorandum and Recommendation [Doc. 51].

After careful consideration of the Magistrate Judge's Recommendation [Doc. 48], the Defendant's Objections thereto [Doc. 49], and the Replies of Defendant Medwest and the Plaintiff [Docs. 50, 51], the Court finds that the Magistrate Judge's proposed conclusions of law are consistent with current case law. Defendant Babalola argues that Medwest cannot be dropped from the case because it is a necessary and indispensable party. Specifically, the Defendant argues that Medwest is necessary and indispensable "in light of its shared interests in the litigation, such as the amount of insurance coverage applicable to Plaintiff's claim and the privileged and/or confidential information in its possession regarding Defendant Babalola's employment, credentialing,

and peer review." [Doc. 49 at 7]. Any insurance coverage by a defendant or any potential defendant, however, is utterly irrelevant to the dispute between the parties. Furthermore, the information that may be in the possession of Medwest regarding Defendant Babalola's employment, credentialing or peer review is subject to discovery in this case regardless of whether Medwest is a party defendant. Defendant Babalola has utterly failed to articulate any grounds on which Medwest is remotely necessary or indispensable to this action. Defendant's Objections to the Memorandum and Recommendation are without merit. Accordingly, the Court hereby overrules the Defendant's Objections and accepts the Magistrate Judge's Recommendation that the Plaintiff's Motion to Dismiss Medwest be granted, and the Defendants' remaining Motions to Dismiss be denied as moot.

In his Objections, Defendant Babalola requests that the Court certify its decision for an immediate appeal and enter an Order staying any further proceedings in this Court pending appeal to the Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals. [Doc. 49 at 14]. The present Order, however, does not involve "a controlling question of law as to which there is substantial ground for difference of opinion." 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b). Further, allowing an immediate appeal of this issue would not "materially advance the ultimate termination of

the litigation." <u>Id.</u> For these reasons, the Defendant's request for certification for immediate appeal is denied.

IT IS, THEREFORE, ORDERED that the Defendant Babalola's Objections to the Magistrate Judge's Memorandum and Recommendation [Doc. 49] are **OVERRULED** and the Magistrate Judge's Memorandum and Recommendation [Doc. 48] is hereby **ACCEPTED**.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the reasons stated in the Memorandum and Recommendation, the Plaintiff's Motion to Dismiss Medwest [Doc. 37] is **GRANTED**, and the Defendant Medwest Health Systems, Inc. f/k/a Harris Regional Hospital, Inc. is hereby **DISMISSED** as a party to this action.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Motions to Dismiss [Docs. 22, 25, 31] filed by Defendants Babalola and Medwest are hereby **DENIED AS**MOOT.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Babalola's request for certification of this Order for immediate appeal pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b) is **DENIED**.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the stay of discovery in this matter is hereby LIFTED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Pretrial Order and Case

Management Plan [Doc. 8] is hereby AMENDED as follows:

- (1) All discovery shall be completed no later than **September 1, 2012**;
- (2) Mediation shall be completed by **September 15**, **2012**;
- (3) All motions except motions in limine and motions to continue shall be filed no later than **October 1, 2012**; and
- (4) Trial is scheduled to commence **WITH a jury** during the first civil trial term beginning on or after **January 28, 2013**.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Signed: May 18, 2012

Martin Reidinger
United States District Judge